

The City Council of the City of Charlotte, North Carolina convened for a Workshop on Monday, June 3, 2013 at 5:21 p.m. in Room 267 of the Charlotte Mecklenburg Government Center with Mayor Anthony Foxx presiding. Councilmembers present were John Autry, Michael Barnes, Warren Cooksey, Andy Dulin, Claire Fallon, David Howard, LaWana Mayfield, and Beth Pickering.

**ABSENT:** Councilmembers Patrick Cannon, Patsy Kinsey and James Mitchell

\* \* \* \* \*

**TRANSPORTATION: North Carolina DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION UPDATE**

**Danny Pleasant, Director of Charlotte Department of Transportation** said I want to introduce tonight Louis Mitchell who is our division engineer from 10<sup>th</sup> highway division of NC DOT. I know in Transportation and Planning Committee there has been an eager to meet Louis, so he's here tonight to update you on some of the things that are happening with DOT projects and he'll get very specific with you. As a reminder, the 10<sup>th</sup> Division employees consist of about 675 employees in five counties including Mecklenburg, Cabarrus, Union, Stanley and Anson. And Louis oversees as division engineer all the activities of the division that range anywhere from traffic engineering to fixing pot holes to repaving streets and overseeing construction. He is district engineer before that which means he is the guy that's here at Mecklenburg County and has feet on the ground for DOT on our behalf so he comes from a lengthy experience with DOT. He also has another career; he's served for 21 years in the United States Army where he is currently a Lieutenant Colonel and Battalion Commander at Fort Stewart, Georgia. He served in Iraq from April 2006 to July 2007 during "Operation Iraqi Freedom" and has received numerous service medals including the Bronze star and all kinds of decorations and badges over his tenure. He comes with an engineering degree from Clemson. He is a registered professional engineer with the State of North Carolina and is a member of American Association of Civil Engineers. He will come now to update you on some NC DOT projects he is working on.

**Louis L. Mitchell, Division 10 Engineer NCDOT** said it is my pleasure to be here tonight. I've been with NCDOT 21 years, most of my term here in Division 10. My predecessor, Barry Moose, who most of you are very familiar with, was a good one; no way can I fill his shoes but I hope to bring the same service and commitment to deliver transportation improvement projects to you. We are a vital part of your community. We are one of your largest land owners with our highway system and we hope to continue the partnership that Barry and my predecessors started. Unlike my predecessors I am a resident of Charlotte and part of Councilmember Barnes' district. Scott passed out a handout to you all for reference after you leave here which has the granular facts about most of our major projects so refer to that. Any errors in the slides will be superseded by the handout. We have a lot to cover. Our roadmap for tonight we will discuss our geographic boundary from our staff, major projects, future projects and a topic that has been in the news as of late, one of our new tools, the I-77 HOT Lanes Project and then I will open it up for your questions as time permits.

I will have to change my bio; we have taken a reduction with the budget, from 600 plus employees down to about 500 employees, still the same lane miles, still the same five geographic counties. I am the division engineer. To my right is Scott Cole, whose role with us similar to the same timeframe that I became Division Engineer, he is the Deputy Division Engineer, and comes with experience and operated our traffic management tenor here in Charlotte for a while. He became a district engineer the same time I did in Union and Anson Counties and then he went on to be our traffic engineer. He knows a lot. Charlotte has a lot of traffic and so he serves as a compliment and dovetails in the area really nicely where I don't have the experience. And to the far right in the middle in the green highlighted box, we have Brett Canipe here. He assumes the

role that I previously had for 10 years as the District Engineer and he would be the guy that is on the ground that will solve all your needs and you won't have to call me. He doesn't live in Charlotte but we are trying to get him over this direction.

As far our board members, John Gullet, he has been our board member for two years now and he will continue to serve at the pleasure of the government and we have a new at-large member, Ned Curran who comes with so much experience and so much skills that he has been named the chairman of the board for the NCDOT in his first term. We feel we have a good compliment there and represented well.

The first project we will talk about is the 485 /85 interchange. It is progressing nicely. Some of the highlights: It is a design built project \$155 million dollars. It should be completed in February 2014 with all the traffic in the lane of 85 around that timeframe. The completion should be about June 2014, but that project is on schedule. It is a partnership between Lane and STV.

Another project by Lane is the I-85 improvements from about Mallard Creek to Highway 73 and that's a recent area as well. The interchange that you see depicted here is the Bruton Smith Boulevard Interchange with the hotel and Concord Mills would be to your left. The original schedule was to be completed in November of this year but the project is starting to creep to the right a little bit because we got a late start due to some complications with obtaining environmental documents. As to the I-485 Outer Loop, the final section is in the University City area and this project has a lot of unique features. It is the last 5.7 miles that goes from NC 115 to I-485. It will be eight lanes of concrete so we can lessen some of the comments on why you didn't do it right the first time. It is a design built project as well about \$140 million and we should have that complete in December 2014. A lot of activity is going on this summer; a lot of confusion. We invite folks to go to our websites. As with Charlotte pass, there will be some roads as you are traversing it. Some road names will change to another so pay close attention. This project will have some DDIs and will have a split Diamond interchange. The DDI will be the first to be in operation in this state and what that is is when you get off on this interchange you it helps with traffic flow because there are less signals. The channelized islands kind of keep you guided in the right direction so that we can prevent some hiccups. Although nothing is a cure for too much alcohol, these islands will get people guided in the right direction.

And then at the bottom of the picture is the split diamond interchange effort that we realize with Charlotte and the land development process and some of the stockholders and how we want this interchange to look. It is a paradigm shift for the NCDOT as we will be allowing buildings, parking and places that in years past people were not totally receptive to. We hope that this project sparks some creativity and ingenuity for us to be able to explore these options elsewhere in the future.

US74 project in Councilman Autry's area is underway. Deveer Construction, which is pretty new to our market, was the winning bidder. It is about a two-mile section and we are progressing. This project is a little bit late from the original start because we realized some of the errors and with the ULI study some revelations came to the forefront and we went back and did a little bit of redesign in configuring to try to make the best use of this corridor.

Councilmember David Howard said Mr. Mitchell thank you for coming. Last time we had a legislative breakfast with our Raleigh delegation, I had the opportunity to talk to Senator Clodfelter and have had similar conversations with Senator Rucho about the fact that they have a lot of concern about this project and the rest of US74 as to whether or not to go forward east. There are opportunities to either accelerate that through this new formula that the Governor was talking about and that this project qualifies for that regional significance and if not that, are we at the I-485 whether or not there is a possibility that at least going on and purchasing the rest of the

right-of-way so that we can go on. At least the business owners out there will know what the rest of the pain will be. So at the very least I was wondering if there's a possibility of buying the right-of-way and the second is does this qualify for some project, maybe even the Governor's new project, that would accelerate this and make it so that we don't keep joking about a mile a decade and get it finished.

Mr. Mitchell said one of the things that I will tell you is that the actual legislation for the governor's strategic mobility formula is not set completely. They are still working between the two versions between the house and the senate and so to tell you exactly how that is going to look, I'd be better telling you which lottery numbers to play. But right now, the formula, they are still kind of tinkering with it. As far as this corridor, we are looking at this corridor as a dovetail to the fast lane study because it is one of the corridors where managed lanes is recommended. We are looking at this corridor to be able to install managed lanes from Uptown all the way to I-485. We will be convening with the City of Charlotte and Matthews on how exactly this corridor should look from this point. My next slide that had a typical section shows what this corridor is going to look now from this point. But as we progress out in the eastern part of Charlotte and into Matthews, we need to come to some type of consensus between Charlotte and Matthews on how that will look. As far as purchasing right-of-way right now, there is no tool in my chest to purchase right-of-way, but Scott will be leading Charlotte and Matthews in an endeavor to get at the feasibility of the managed lane all the way from Uptown to I-485 and of course, if we are successful, that will be right where the link is to take off for the Monroe connector so we could have a managed lane all the way from uptown Charlotte to Monroe.

US-74, this is the vision currently, the lane was the old vision. Up top is the old vision and down low is the new vision for US-74. This is some graphics that we showed in the community outreach effort a couple of weeks ago. This is conceptual of how the Sharron Amity Interchange would look as we progress. This is a graphic of how the Idlewild interchange would look. On the southend, 485 South we have awarded a contract for the widening. It is a 9.2 mile segment of I-485. It was the first section that we destructed. We will go from four lanes to six lanes with the ability to have a wide shoulder to incorporate managed lanes into the future. There will be an auxiliary lane from US 521 to NC 51 and we will be widening all the bridges along this corridor. One of the big hallmarks of this project is the Johnson Flyover leading from the Ballantine area to I-485 Inner. It is about an \$83 million dollar project and the completion date is December 2014. We are in June of 2013 but that is the completion date; 23 months ahead of the anticipated schedule. This is a lane project as well—one of our partners to the north on the design bill project.

As to future projects, some of them are inside of Charlotte's incorporated limited but I thought they were major enough to bring them to your attention. The George Lyles Extension that will hit US29 near the Phillip Morris properties should be June 2013. That crept to the right as we were having some complication with right-of-way and as you know Garden Parkway is on hold.

Mr. Howard asked do you have money set aside for the Garden Parkway.

Mr. Mitchell said previously there was a portion of the budget that allocated a stipend to the Garden Parkway. That stopped with the last legislative session. In some of the strategic mobility bills right now, it does mention the Garden Parkway. One bill was for concreting it in its place and the other version was for eliminating the Garden Parkway along with the Mid-Currituck and I think there was one other in there. So there are still some negotiations but as far as funding, there used to be funding that came off the top for the planning purposes but I think that has since stopped.

Mr. Howard said so there is no money in the TIP local or state for that price, if at all?

Mr. Mitchell said not right now.

Mr. Barnes asked Mr. Mitchell could you go back one slide. Is 2507 on schedule to complete in November 2013?

Mr. Mitchell said that is to start in November 2013.

Mr. Barnes said and when would it finish?

Mr. Mitchell said it would be late 2016 because we are starting so late in November that the earliest we probably could move dirt would be March 2014 and its full two year endeavor to deliver that project.

Mr. Barnes said I've gotten a number of questions. Are we going to be able to link City Blvd with that extension?

Mr. Pleasant said the City is providing funding for it

Mr. Barnes said that is correct. We are going to do the contract administration.

Ms. Fallon said do you live on David Cox Road?

Mr. Mitchell said no I don't. I live on US 29 out by the freeway.

Ms. Fallon said that's the best reconstruction of a road I have ever seen. Thank you.

Mr. Mitchell said I will pass that on to our maintenance folks. Some more future projects we will talk a little bit more I-485...the one at the top. That is the 85 expansion from the current NC 73 limits of the project that we have under construction now and that will take it almost to the Rowan county line. Just short of the Rowan line. That segment we will through our design and bill process in November of 2013. We are finishing up the environmental documents as we speak--getting that ready for November.

On I77 the HOT Lane projects is a huge endeavor for the NCDOT. It is unparalleled and has never been undertaken in this state previously. It is a proposed P3 project that we hope to have commercial close on in November of this year. The title of this is the HOT Lanes Proposed Noise Walls. The project is from 85S (approximately the 277 Brookshire area). We are going to widen to two HOT/HOV lanes in this segment. If most of you are familiar with Charlotte, you know that we currently have an aesthetic brick wall through this segment of the City and it's a pretty proud accomplishment, one that we worked with the City on in the past to construct. Through some of my research, I found that Frank Emory along with the city council then felt that the wall was so important that the city actually contributed to the construction of the brick wall through this corridor. As we undertake this project and do the expansion, most of which will occur in the median, we found that through our testing, in accordance with our noise policies it's going to require that we destruct noise walls in this corridor, which will produce several opportunities for us to have to solve some situations. We wanted to bring it to your attention tonight as we are going issue our final RFP (request for proposal) to the industry in mid to late June. So this item will become public knowledge as far as the noise walls with that RFP. Through this corridor, we have some EJ communities that we have had to deal with in the past and we have successfully dealt with those matters and tonight we want to make you familiar with the issue. I77 itself has been a lightning rod, often times things hit the media and become misconstrued or all of the facts along with the issue are never presented and so tonight we want to give you an up close look at some of the opportunities there before it is spun in the media. It is a situation that we look forward to dealing with City Staff on both planning and the transportation and the City Manager's Office because there are several options that we can take and based on those options, it will determine where we land as far as environmental documents. Several stakeholders we are dealing with: State Historic Preservation Society on this matter as well. So what you see depicted is I-277 to I-85. The yellow is the proposed new noise walls.

There are noise walls along I-277 and there are noise walls along I-77 where the brick walls are. This is the existing configuration today of the HOT lane.

Mr. Dulin said so we are talking about new noise walls. Does that mean that the brick walls will have to be deconstructed and replaced with new walls?

Mr. Mitchell said the walls that are there today are not noise walls, they are aesthetic walls.

Mr. Dulin said I'll need to know how much the City contribution was to those brick walls then.

Mr. Mitchell said I have some professionals here that can give you that information. This is the proposed configuration for I-77 with the two lanes. You will notice we have one today and two in the future. Today, the existing privacy walls, councilman. Some of the things we need to talk about is deconstruct; there will be the opportunities to where the alignment of the noise wall will be superimposed on the alignment of the existing privacy wall. There are some situations where they are 10, 50 100 feet apart. We have to work out those situations as maintenance between those corridors will become a question as well as access to be able to maintain those areas in the future. We know that there is no intention to have gaps where someone could leave the I-77 right-of-way and enter the communities. The gaps that are mentioned here would be maintenance gaps for the wall because if we don't have maintenance gaps at strategic locations then we would have to access it from personal property which is not a desired outcome.

Mr. Dulin said is it not possible for an existing privacy wall to double up as a sound barrier wall? You're killing me on tearing down a brick wall.

Mr. Mitchell said what we found in accordance with our policy is the wall today would not have ample height. A few units probably could serve that purpose but some of the units, what we're finding is but our engineering is not indicating that it's yielding the abatement as far as the noise to some of the receptacles and that is the individual units that are experiencing the significant change in decibels. This is just a good microcosm of what we are dealing with in the corridor. The top of the picture at [inaudible] Street neighborhood and that is the picture to the left. Today you can see the brick wall. The yellow here would be the new dog walk. So of course there is opportunities in this area, we would have to deconstruct the wall as you indicated to install the dog walk. But there are other opportunities here where we would not have to do that, but what about the maintenance here, the access, who do we get to that? So of the property owners may not want to maintain up to the DOT's wall. There are a lot of opportunities for discussion. We look forward to working with the City staff. On the eastern side, which is I77N, as you can see, the wall is here but today's existing aesthetic wall is to the [inaudible] of the right of way (28:22). This is a visual of how that looks from the interstate.

Mr. Dulin said I'm not one that wants to tear down something we already got to rebuild it. Is there any chance we could ask those neighborhoods if they would like to have their fancy brick instead of concrete slabs sound barrier wall?

Mr. Mitchell said I'm going to ask our noise and environment professional to come up. He will talk to you about the voting process for the walls.

Mr. Howard said I'm worried about the aesthetics. Can brick walls act as sound barriers? On Independence and all over Raleigh are they just aesthetics or do they act as sound barriers too?

Mr. Mitchell said the wall in Charlotte is an aesthetic wall that replaced the old wooden fence: The walls that you see us constructing today, most of them are noise walls. There are certain portions of the 440 Belt line where that's an aesthetic wall. If we could progress, we are going to get to some options here that we think could get us to the same landing point. Greg will talk to you about whether the walls have to be constructed or not and the voting process to get us there.

**Greg Smith** said we do noise analyses and those dictate the way noise walls are designed and they are based on reducing noise levels for predicted noise. In this case, like Louis was saying, are the yellow lines are locations of predicted noise walls. This brick wall cannot stay and will be moved back, but the existing walls are about 11 feet tall and one of the main things about noise walls is that you have to get high enough to where you block the traffic. In the picture in the top left corner, you can see over the wall to the house so that wall is providing no noise abatement or reduction for those houses. We require that any time that any time we have those walls, they don't have to be built, but we give the community the option. They have to send in ballots and we solicit their votes. We will build the wall once we get a simple majority that says they want it. The balloted members of the communities are those that receive at least a 5db noise level reduction from the construction of that wall and we know who they are from the model and we will be sending out those ballots very soon. We treat each wall separately. We know who is receiving the noise reduction from each wall. So one wall community may say we don't want it and we won't build that wall, but any others if they want it, we will. So we will be sending out those ballots by mail very soon.

Mr. Howard said does that mean you have a communication with everyone in the community to let everyone know that this is coming and that process will happen?

Mr. Mitchell said we will work with the city staff. We met with city staff earlier and some of your key business leaders are very familiar with this corridor and the some of the organizations that we can have outreach to and if we need have strategic meetings or special meetings with say the dean Street Neighborhood association, we will meet with those folks but the balloting itself is targeted towards specific units that are affected as Gregg indicated, but we will meet with these neighborhoods and I think we have already had one meeting and I can't remember which association.

Mr. Howard said I didn't realize it was coming into Genesis Park as much as it is. I do care about that. I just didn't know that that was happening. So I just want to make sure that whole neighborhood was aware of this happening and not just having the people who would hit the 5.5 db. I am concerned, as Mr. Dulin, it's not just the sound it's the way it looks. Right now the brick wall has a great presentation into the city as well. It's not just what it does for the neighborhood.

Mr. Mitchell said I think some of the options we will go over we will soothe some of those concerns.

Ms. Fallon asked have you gotten complaints about noise.

Mr. Mitchel said not yet but through the environmental process, it does make them eligible, and so we do have to address those. Both our policy and the Federal Highway Policy require it.

Ms. Fallon said if you haven't gotten complaints about it, why would you replace them?

Mr. Mitchell said we have to give them the option. We have to give them the vote.

Mr. Smith said the federal law dictates that we do noise analyses for every type one project which is typically widening or new location. This definitely qualifies as a type one project and with those we have to do noise analyses and if noise walls meet the reasonable and feasible criteria within the policy then one of the considerations under reasonableness is do the affected citizens want it. So it is dictated by federal regulations and our policy is an extension of the federal regulations.

Ms. Fallon said so if they want to keep the brick walls, and they don't want these things, then they keep the brick walls?

Mr. Smith said we build them unless we receive a simple major that says they do not way the walls.

Ms. Fallon asked you will make sure that they know they have to do that?

Mr. Mitchel said one of the things we will talk about is texture. There is an option for texture that looks like brick now.

\* \* \* \* \*

## **WELCOME TO UKRAINIAN MAYORS**

Mayor Foxx said we will take a pause and Joining us tonight are five mayors from the country of Ukraine. Who are participating in the 2013 Open World Leadership Program which is a congressionally sponsored program that brings in major leaders from Russia, Ukraine and other Eurasian states to the United States in order to give them firsthand knowledge of the American system, a participatory democracy and free enterprise? The program is administered by the Open World Leadership Center located at the Library of Congress in Washington DC and International House is hosting this delegation for their visit to Charlotte. We welcome you and are glad to have you here. The open World Program emphasizes principles of accountability, transparency and citizen involvement in government. Our distinguished guests are very interested in discussing the system of government in Charlotte and to share their experiences with their individual city government counterparts. I am also aware that many of these mayors are interested in social economic and cultural development and infrastructure, municipal finance and budgets, constituent service and urban and regional planning. You have a lot of expertise around this table in all of these subjects.

In the last two weeks we have a number of international visitors: ambassadors from Mexico, the Philippines, and South Africa. We are proud that Charlotte is an international world class, first rate city and I am thrilled that our decision to transition the Charlotte International Cabinet in our chief protocol into the official roll with our economic development department means that we can leverage these relationships. Everyone can come up to the podium.

**Delegation introductions** – Mr. Serhiy Sehiyovych Mazur (Mayor, Balta City); Mr. Kostyantyn Hryhorovych Rubanenko (Mayor Bakchysaray); M. Oleh Mykolayovych Svidersky (Depute Head of County, Secretary of City County, Volodymyr-Volynsk City Council); Ms. Iryna Andriyivna Vereshchuk (Mayor, Rava Ruska); Mr. Volodymyr Oleksandrovych Volvach (Mayor, Molochansky); Ms. Inna Yuriyivna Vdovenko (Open World Program Assistant, American Councils for International Education, Open World Program;

## **Return to DOT presentation**

Mr. Mitchell said some of your possible options would be brick texturing, stoning texturing, concrete texturing even though we realize that that was not as palatable for most folks. There is even the option to having different texturing from the community side versus the highway side. We are exploring options of having cities put markers. Say if you wanted the Queens' crown at strategic locations on the right-of-way side, that could be incorporated as well or any other symbol that the City deems necessary. Coloring: We have some basic sand tones that are recommended. There are always options. We just wanted to present you facts tonight. We are going to continue to work with the City Staff to come to a solution. We think planning and the DOT has some resources and connections with outreach that we can leverage to get this matter to a good landing place and so there are no final determinations yet. We just want you to be familiar with the issues because we do feel that when the RFP becomes public to the market, it will generate a lot of questions and I felt that you didn't need to be blindsided by this issue because people can get pretty passionate about some of these items.

Councilmember Warren Cooksey asked is TTP open to a collaborative arts project to have a mural painted on a sound reducing wall?

Mr. Mitchell said we are receptive to arts. One of the things we have images such as art sometimes you can drive a certain segment to do things that are not wanted by entire city.

Mr. Cooksey said that is my point. I fear particularly looking at the color choices that there is always the risk that large “splods” of land colored surfaces attract amateur arts.

Mr. Mitchell said, what I can tell you about that is with these types of surfaces, they can be painted or stained on and I can return them to that color. I can tell you that I am having a considerable amount difficulty in returning some of the brick portions that they actual paint on now to the right color. Most of the time we are able to get it off with some acid washing and some pressure washing but there has been some if you got really close that has been very difficult for us to eradicate.

Mr. Cooksey said to give us an example of the surface that I think is possible, although maybe on the interstate it would be too distracting with that level of details. If you haven't travelled under the Matheson Street Bridge over in North Davidson Street you should because that's a really nifty mural project that livened up what under a bridge can look like. It just occurred to me if we are talking about this much surface, especially when you said you were open to a crown symbol or something perhaps some sort of painting.

Mr. Mitchell said we look forward to the opportunity to solve this with our city partners and as to Howard's question for public involvement, we still have the environmental process which we have to have FONSI (finding of no significant impact) and we have to have public meetings for that where we will talk about these walls at some of those conferences for the neighborhoods that are affected as well.

Mr. Howard said just to understand this, the way I've seen this is that you guys drop down these beams and then you insert these inflections in. Is that still the way this is done?

Mr. Mitchell said we do have new concrete columns that we can insert instead of the old steel beams that we slip the panels on. So we can have actual concrete panels that we can insert to the ingrown and then slip the textured panels inside the concrete beams.

Mr. Howard said I would love to see conceptually how that works together.

Mr. Mitchell said we have begun with the concrete columns already up near the 485/85 interchange on the southern side. We have the concrete panels. None of those are brick textured so you get a good idea of what the concrete pile columns will look in that area.

Mr. Howard asked so on 85 or 485?

Mr. Mitchell answered it's on 85 itself. It's on the concord mills side on the south side of that interchange.

Ms. Fallon asked on the brick looking ones, can they be painted red?

Mr. Mitchell answered yes and I have been told that the only drawback there is that the elements can sometimes change that to a color such as pink and not sure if the transition from red to pink and the perpetual maintenance to upgrade that if it's going to be a resource or revenue prohibitive. With the sand tones, those typically transition to a different sand tone that requires less maintenance.

Mr. Dulin said I vividly remember when those walls were put up and it adds costs every time you lay a brick, but I really think that those people along those lines, and I understand having to come into Genesis Park and that wall comes down. The other side, I really don't like to do the same job twice; If we have a wall there that's a nice wall and the folks want to keep their brick wall then I sure hope they can. Anywhere else that we have to take a brick wall down I'd like an

opportunity for those folks to get a brick wall back; knowing that it would seem that we have brick-looking stamped concrete, that might do; We can't run brick walls all over the state but those walls in that section that we have been talking about tonight, I am proud of those walls, remember when they were built and if those neighbors would like to keep their nice brick walls, I certainly like any way we can to abide by their wishes.

SHPO is one of the partners that we have to work with on this which is the state Historic Preservation Officials and the option is that they have returned to us pending the city and the local stakeholders. Most of those have been a brick facade in nature that SHPO has already agreed to bless. But again, we look to working with your key business leaders on this. If anything changes, we will come back to you with those options as well, but I think we can get to a workable solution with the outreach contacts that they have. Because of the federal process though, we will have to let the neighborhood weigh in on this.

Mr. Autry asked is there anything that is going to address pedestrian and bicycle infrastructure. Can you provide us any kind of insight on where the state is settling on those issues?

Mr. Mitchell answered one of the things that we embarked upon last year was our complete streets policy. We do realize that there are multi modes that need to operate safely and efficiently in our corridor and so we made more a conscious effort to work with our municipalities and jurisdictions on incorporating bicycle and pedestrian facilities into our corridor. There are some trains out there that have recently been approved. [Inaudible] Crossing in particular is the Hawk signal. If you have more questions about that, Scott is here and he can address those, but I think there is a hawk signal on Sharon Amity that the city staff has utilized already and it's been fully vetted by the NUTCV at the appropriate locations we will start having those in our corridors as well. The hawk signal is simply the signal it's not really for cars, it's a signal that the pedestrian actuates and it stops traffic for the pedestrians to cross particularly at problem and high traffic areas.

Mr. Autry said in your summation of the projects, is there anything in any of those figures of the amounts of what the projects are costing that is going to address the pedestrian infrastructure?

Mr. Mitchell responded as we go through the planning process, we address pedestrian and bicycle accommodations, There are some opportunities particularly for a municipality like Charlotte where some of those opportunities require caution and in your city staff has pretty diligent in getting those treatments into our projects. Most of the projects that I have been involved with, we have had a considerable amount of City feedback in maybe reducing the lane from 12 to 11 to give a four or five foot bike lane and so we have had some collaborative effort with your staff already. Almost all of these projects have pedestrian accommodations, including US74. There is a sidewalk along both sides both east and westbound US74.

Mr. Autry asked, bicycle infrastructure?

Mr. Mitchell said I don't remember bicycle lanes on US74. I'm not sure that there are bicycle lanes on US74.

Mr. Barnes said I have a policy question regarding Hwy 24 (Harris Blvd). I had some discussions over the years with Danny and others about slowing that road down and making it more community friendly. "Goat paths" There is a lot of foot traffic now along that road and a number of citizens have asked me whether sidewalks there would be possible and what I have always understood is that NCDOT won't allow sidewalks along a high-speed corridor of that nature and I was wondering if you and Danny had the conversation about any long-term strategy to deal with slowing down that roadway and maintaining the same traffic flow and strategies to make it safer for pedestrians and vehicles because people have been killed. One lady was killed because a guy was doing 80mph in a Ford Expedition and he flipped over and landed in the westbound lanes. So there has been a lot of craziness in terms of speed in that corridor and there are a lot of people riding bikes and walking now along Harris. I just wanted to know if you had any conversation in that respect.

Mr. Mitchell said we have not had a conversation about that. That topic has come up. One of the things that we are going to be doing is similar to what happened to the southwest portion of the city, when we open the western side of I485 from I85 down towards Hwy 160. The demographic of the traffic and patterns of the travel significantly changed along Billy Graham Parkway. I don't have a crystal ball to know how the university area will react once we open up this last segment. If the opportunity does become available to where that happens and we can transition this from an expressway or freeway, because there are portions of Harris Blvd that function like an expressway or freeway. If that actually makes itself available, then we will have conversation with the City of exactly what we want out of this corridor moving to the future. So re-designation, we will have to look at that at that time, but I would hope that if we let I485 open, we will see what the traffic patterns prove out and then make some informed decisions from there.

Councilmember Beth Pickering asked, regarding street lights on I77, do those fall under your purview?

Mr. Mitchell said yes they do. I77 the roadway lighting is NCDOT responsibility and your specific question.

Ms. Pickering said well there are many that are out along I77 and I am wondering what the status of those are.

Mr. Mitchell said the last inventory that we did; I think we had about 90% of them on. There are some opportunities out there where we are going to have to do some re-lamping and we have those programmed into the next fiscal year budget which starts in July and so my staff is ready to go with two contracts to do some re-lamping along both the 85 and 77 corridors. From time to time we have problems with circuitry and actually unfortunately, we have times where there is theft where people actually steal from the infrastructure. They actually steal the wire. So we are cognizant of it. We intend to keep it well lite, but some of the bulbs have seen their useful life out there and so we are going to do some re-lamping in the fall.

Ms. Pickering said so as of July, we might see.....

Mr. Mitchell said yes. That's when the new fiscal year starts. I'm not sure. I couldn't tell you today when that contract will actually hit the street, but I will hunt that answer down and have one of our staffers give you an answer when that contract will happen.

Mayor Foxx said I had an opportunity to do a fly over with Louis. You all have been doing a lot of work in this area and I think the story for many years was that we weren't getting projects done and we have had a lot of projects happen in this area and we thank you for your help. Mr. Mr. Dulin was good enough to point out that we should thank you for your military service as well and your service to the country so thank you very much.

\* \* \* \* \*

**CENTER CITY PARTNERS – BRIEFING ON OFFICE, RETAIL AND RESIDENTIAL;**

Mayor Foxx said we now move to Center City Partners. This is a briefing on Economic Development Office Retail and Residential.

**Mike Smith, Center City Partners** said I am pleased to have the opportunity to bring you guys a little bit of a briefing on the state of the center city; it's such a great point of pride for our community and it's a reflection of your leadership and the leadership of decades before each of us. It created such an asset for our community for growth in investment, talent and jobs in our community. This organization has been around for 35 years. This basically is the way we have served over those 35 years and why we were created. It's about facilitating vibrancy, job growth and really servicing as a foundation for a healthy regional economy for all Charlotteans to enjoy and that is the way we connect out.

As to the work that we do, it is our focus about growing jobs, growing investment and recruiting and retaining the best talent. What do we do? Our focus is around providing professional services to serve you and to serve this community around research, planning, business recruitment, marketing, event production and advocacy. I want to share some high points as to what this Center City offers to our community. It has been an incredible place of investment, mostly private. Since 2000 there has been \$6.4 billion dollars of investment in our Center City and that's Uptown and southend. We currently have almost 14,500 residents in uptown and 3,200 in southend and of those residents in uptown, 58% have moved there in the last five years. Great urban places are built in layers. Those layers are great jobs, great urban residential, great hospitality, great academic institutions and it's also retail. We are working very hard to make to try and make sure that we have good mature uses of all that infrastructure.

Just some quick overviews on Uptown and southend; of the 70 retailers, there are 160 restaurants, 25 entertainment venues, nine institutions of higher learning. If you recall in the 2020 vision plan, creating this urban campus was one the core values and core aspirations of this vision plan. We have made some great progress in that regard. We've got 19 hotels and 4200 hotel rooms. In the Southend, we have 196 retailers, 67 restaurants, 57 arts, furnishing and design establishments, and 328 service providers--so a lot of small business.

From a destination standpoint, we have 11 million visitors to uptown. Some of which are out of town and some are within region. We are the arts, culture and entertainment center of the region. There are eight new venues that have been built just in the last four years and we continue to have great success in introducing our community to guests during conventions (CIAA, the NRA, Urban land Institute, the International Downtown Association, the International Economic Development Council and the DNC)

Mr. Howard said on all those events that you just named, are we seeing any upside or follow-up from anyone that came, especially the DNC?

Mr. Smith said last year we had a trifecta where we had all the downtown executives, planning professionals, we had the economic development crew, and the media and corporate leaders, DNC and then on top of that the Bank of America made some balance sheet moves where they sold a bunch of their prime assets and the beauty of that is any institutional investor that is in business underwrote Charlotte and they came to Charlotte and understood our fundamentals, and it paid off [...inaudible...] like Parkway came to town and bought three towers. They spent \$500 billion on just uptown assets. Now every time they go and talk to the research community they quiz them on how much of your investment goes in Charlotte. So now we have analysts writing the story on why they're so invested here and we have had the nice uptake in institutional money. I used to talk to institutional investors from 2003 to 2006/7 and they could hear the story, understand our vision plan, and then got [...inaudible...] for about three years and they are back. I can't attest that all of that is because of these conventions but it's clear that it was a huge negotiating factor.

Mr. Howard said my concern I think we did some stuff to get in front the convention that without that exposure, I would hope we are being intentional not waiting for them to call us but making contacts and maybe Ron Kimble who spent some time with the DNC, I would love if we saw some results all of that or what we did with the information we gathered. Because after having all those folks in town, if all we did was just stay same in the same position, we didn't do anything with it. It's been my concern since last year that's why I keep bringing it up. What did we do with all that exposure because you will never get that again?

Mr. Smith said there are a few things that we have done. We started the National PR campaign before we won the DNC. We have re-funded that. We re-hired on a small scale, you just names; any follow-up with DCI and that had great results for us in helping us. We did some surveys with corporate relocation consultants and CEOs and we studied who were when we looked at what were the gaps, who are we and what are we good at and what we are known for. So then we focused the PR work on informing that gap so that people know that we are a great energy center and they know about the quality of our airport and they know the strength of our health and life science. Those were three things that were identified as gaps. I think that's been pretty

effective and I know the Chambers and the Regional Partnership have done follow-up reports. It's their discrete mission to follow-up on those things.

Let me jump now to residential. This is a great story of Charlotte. In regarding to tracking and retaining talent, we can say that Center City is a secret weapon for making sure that all the great talent coming out of schools in Georgia, Virginia, Tennessee, North Carolina and South Carolina want to come to Charlotte. When I moved to Chicago, I wanted to live [inaudible]. It was a specific neighborhood and I think you have to offer that kind of specificity and that kind of environment to bring great talent to your community and its working. With regard to residential, we've got 25 projects that were announced that are under construction around residential uptown and southend. There are 2459 units that are completed or under construction. 811 are in uptown and 1600+ in Southend and then the pipeline was another 2400 units and it's pretty even split between uptown and southend. That's the infrastructure and this is a reflection of private money responding to public investment infrastructure. They like what we are doing because it's a lot of institutional money coming to town.

Mr. Barnes said are the 25 plus projects the same quantity 2429?

Mr. Smith said the 25 includes those under construction and just completed.

Mr. Barnes said so its 4800?

Mr. Smith said yes those two combined. If you go to the next slide, it is a snapshot of what you are seeing essentially in population: Uptown growth from 8,100 to 15,000 shortly. The SouthEnd growth went from 1,000 to 5,000 in a 13 year span. It's about 20,000 in the center city which is a nice base and if there is more coming behind that in that 20,000+ does not include the pipeline projects and does not include some of those that are presently under construction.

It's a good verity of projects. Like the silos at south end which is built on nine acres and 280 apartments, \$26 million dollar developments. The one immediately adjacent to the BBT Ballpark in Romare Beardon Park, it's only on 1.2 acres. Its 352 apartments and then you've got the private sector again responding to this concentration of housing. We have been aspiring for a grocery store on the southend for 15 years and Publix is coming to town and making a great investment there. They are putting parking below grade. They are adding street front retail. Its two levels of subterranean parking and it's going to be adjacent to the new Camden South line apartment project and it will be right across from the Lowes. So with all this residential coming, it gives us a strong base but we have got to continue to mature the urban place to accommodate not just the guests and the urban workforce and the students, but also all of these residents. We have got some great stuff going on. Romare Bearden Park will be completed by late summer and there has been some great progress made. You can see a today photo of that BBT Ballpark which will open in April 2014 is making great progress. There is a topping off of that on Thursday, a \$54 Million dollar project. First Ward Park which we hope will start later this year and then Second Ward Park which is 2.8 acres and that will move concurrent with the redevelopment of Marshall Park and the Board of Ed. Lastly, among these kind of amenities that are being contemplated or constructed currently, the 20/20 Plan recommended creating this trail along the Blue Line and the concept is to create this necklace of active and passive activities along the Blue Line and have it come in and connect into the infrastructure of Uptown, connecting an wrapping around our convention center and our Hall of Fame. But the idea is that it would connect seven different neighborhoods. It would be 3.3 miles in one direction and 2 miles just in the southend. Here is a quick look at just the southend component of it. We hired a team of Terry Shock, David Firman and Richard Petershien. There great designers from Charlotte and they came up with huge ideas. 80 different interventions and the idea behind this is not to do the big bond offering but to do this thing all at once. That would be very anti-south end. This has to be textural. It has to have lots of input from the community. It needs to have the community investing in it. We want to do this as a partnership and that's how we are trying to frame this from the beginning. Here's a little bit of the before and after of just being able to come upon some porch swings on underutilized public owned land near the Camden Station. The idea of taking some underutilized found spaces and creating this Prices Chicken Coop outdoor dining space where everyone using the sidewalk and sits on the curb. Then there are

spots like this along the expressway that you could introduce City View Park. It is right off College and I277.

From an office standpoint, office space is our key to job growth. It's an issue worth pausing and thinking about because it's the key ingredient to economic development. We've got this tradition of adding 4 million square feet a decade to our center city. In fact from 2008 to 2010, there was a 19% increase in private office space in the center city. Its 41% of all the office space in the county and in 2012, we have this incredible absorption of that office space 2.3% reduction of vacancy. So now we are almost 9% and we will be below that shortly. If you look back through the decades, here is the square, Belks, Ivy's, the first NCNB tower. If you look there was a half million square of office developed in that decade in the 1960s and then in the 1970s there was 4.1 MM sf developed. In the 1980s there was 3.7 MM sf and in the 1990s 5MM sf. In 2000 there was 6 mm sf developed. And then in the 2010 there was zero sf developed. None developed to date, none announced since 2007. This may seem like a small thing, it's not. Let me share a couple of stats about why. 40% of the county's office growth during this period of 2010-13 was office space being consumed in the center city and growing jobs. We jumped 23% to over 100K employees in the center city. This is according to the last census data. This is a high correlation between job growth and the availability of space. The problem right now our large of blocks of class "A" office are dwindling. We have three big blocks of Class A at Fifth-third, Independence Center and 525 N. Tryon. Then we have a couple of spots for B/C space.

Here is a quick analysis on headquarters recruiting. This matters because in 2011 21% of the projects were headquarters jobs. We are a prime location for headquarters and we want headquarters because we love small business but big business provides work for small business. They work like this. So 16 headquarter projects in 2011. Average projects were 759 jobs. That's a big increase over 2005-10. \$51MM per project and then 19% of the headquarters projects were over 100K jobs. This is good investment opportunities. We have had seven projects sold between 2011 and 2013—almost one billion in investments; 4.2MM sf of our uptown. Good price per square foot in sales.

Mr. Howard said was there a need for us to market to developers about just the need for office space? That slide tells me that we need to recruit more businesses to Charlotte. Which one is it? Is it the space or is it the recruitment.

Mr. Smith said the reason this works is that we have the supply. When we entered the recession, we had just developed 3.9 million square feet of office space. A 23% increase in our inventory. We've got 22million square feet. We don't have that anymore. These folks don't wait. And that's the next point.

Mr. Howard said what I was just telling the Mayor is that we had McCauley Crutchfield kind of push that whole race with the buildings. What's the new model?

Mr. Smith said that's the struggle. We've been very fortunate. We've had banks build our parking decks; and we have had banks build our office towers and the way they built them is not based on return on investment but based on earnings per share. So they built incredible quality. They brought world-class architects, they built stuff that they can be proud of; they brought stuff that as employee moral goes up, efficiency goes, which means they perform better and now that we are flipping from a bank driven model to a developer driven model. We are going to have to figure out what that is and there are some good projects right now we are on the cusp of going. We have been spending a lot time working with institutional investors and with developers to try to tell this story that we are sharing with you. Here is the scary part. There are two projects that we lost because of lack of space. And it's tight and it gets even tighter if you want above the 15<sup>th</sup> floor. And headquarters projects want above the 15<sup>th</sup> floor. So it's getting tighter and tighter. So we miss 2500 potential jobs in FIRE. We've got four projects out right now with 3900 jobs and I've showed how tight it is and they won't wait. They are not going to come to town and say I'll be a part of a new project, build it, and I'll be patient. It takes 30/36 months and if you've got half that are in need of an apartment building you can get it done about 40-46 months. It's just that we are going take an investment risk. We have to found out ways to incent them.

Mr. Dulin said I think it's important when you say "we" as in downtown, but Charlotte did not lose those two lower projects. They went to competitors in another part of Charlotte.

Mr. Smith said one did and we lost one to a competitor

Mr. Dulin said so 1300 of that 2500 jobs are coming to our community. We just lost them for uptown. So the private sector in other parts of the community are still building. Now you're a non-profit, not a developer so we have to get the guys who are developers to start spending money. The problem is most of those guys uptown are starting to wane. Freddy Cline still perfectly capable of building spec space uptown but whether he is willing to tee it up at this point of his career, we will see. You have a better read on that than I do.

Mr. Smith said we've got developers. We've got business coming to town and we work with the state and the state selected Hines to be the master developer for the Gateway Station. [...inaudible...] Crescent Parcel at south Tryon and [...inaudible...] city owned parcels along Stonewall. There is the Epicenter. There are good locations where there is institutional interest. It's just not been our model. So we are working hard to try and figure that out.

Barnes: What I am hearing are opportunities. I think what you are describing is a fantastic opportunity for somebody who is in the office building development business. What would you suggest be done to encourage the private sector in order to turn one of those spaces you just mentioned into an office tower.

Mr. Smith said one of the things we have to figure out down the road is parking. We have been very fortunate to not have had to invest in municipal parking. I don't know if that's the right route. I'm not coming with a recommendation.

Mr. Barnes said I'm just saying based upon your conversations of what you heard, is someone saying, look we want to bring 2000 -2500 jobs to Charlotte, but we need some space, we need some floors in a tower and so if you have been hearing that; one of the things I think I just heard you say is that they may want some help with parking. Are there any other things that you think, we could do in the near term to help facilitate.

Mr. Smith said we've made great investments in our center city. I think that what we are doing in regard to transit make us top tier selections. We've got to make sure that we've got the inventory to be able proceed with prospects. I think it's going to back to parking and some kind of a municipally owned solution at some level that some projects may require and some may not. I think that we need to continue to fulfill the 20/20 vision plans. Part of which is retail. We just hosted the DNC and walkable urban environment. Everything was close, but we didn't have enough hotel rooms downtown and there was the shopping. We've got a couple of studies right now: One on the southend and one in uptown as part of the 20/20 vision trying to figure out that riddle. The problems we have right now are retail and it's not built to accommodate it. Therefore there is not a concentration so these great retailers we talk to they want co-tenancy. Gap wants to be here. We are going to have to figure out ways to create environments to continue to enhance that.

Mr. Howard said I'm thinking about the history. I could be wrong but the last buildings that were built not tied to a bank just on Spec would be the Caroline and the Charlotte Plaza. We haven't had other buildings built not connected to.

Mr. Smith said there was NASCAR and the Alon building.

Mr. Howard said so it's just not something people do a lot around here. So it just begs the question, should we be talking to the banks as opposed to talking to the developer community. Is that part of the strategy? Or is that part of our history?

Mr. Smith said I promise that I am in regular conversation with the banks but it's not where this next project is going to come from. We could still see some but it's part of the reason we have not had a lot of just pure developer driven office product is because the Part of [inaudible] market is so highly influenced by the banks and their demand for space that they were concerned

that there was no diversity. We are developing that diversity. We've got constant little announcements of being the North American Headquarters for a firm like Germany and China. We've got a lot more going on around energy services and continue to development of professional services as well

Ms. Mayfield said let me follow that question up with another which is, we've had some conversation around the dais just within our fiscal; looking at our bond rating; some of the rating agencies have come back asking questions, not making determinations but asking questions about the relative health of large employers in the city as it relates to continuing to keeping our tax strong. Can you speak to that because as it relates to this issue of commercial office space, what strikes me is an unfortunate event or two could create a lot of capacity in our office towers? I think that's straight talk if we are going to have a conversation about office space, we need to be thinking about all the various scenarios and why a private developer might or might not choose to put a speculative project in place.

Mr. Smith said I think those types of questions are best answered not on individuals but on sectors and if you look at the energy infrastructure of our nation. So much of the major investment in nuclear kind of wrapped up in the early late 70s early 80s. We got so much accrued maintenance can lead to review the [inaudible]. So there on this track before their market cap was about \$ 22 billion. They had a 5 year cap of about 30billion. That translates to jobs because that is CapX.... That's professional services. The energy sector--that's why you see Duke's coming back and asking for rate increases. We've got to catch up with our ability to create [inaudible].

Ms. Fallon said we also are competing for tourism. The city is going to become a big tourism and the retail is so important because when you walk in Europe you can walk anyplace and there are stores and that's where your money is--people coming in and spending. Your tax money comes from it. How do we encourage this? Is there a retailer that does multi beside GAP and Navy because I would hate to see us become Grafton in Dublin, which was a lovely street and now it's got Banana Republic, Navy, Gap and it's taken the flavor of the place way. But is there is a retailer who does multiple different types of stuff that we can encourage to do one block because that would then fall over with another retailer coming to the next block.

Mr. Smith said the Key is relationships. It's getting a developer who has relationship with retailers and who can put together a more complex system and who has a relationship with another city. I see a lot of these downtowns and saw an incredible downtown in Fort Collins, Colorado. Also, Denver similar to Louisville in maturity retail environment. Right now we enjoy an incredible hospitality in this town. So now we have a mature fully functioning restaurant industry and here's the problem. Its' gotten so strong that if you've got ground floor space, you can command 38, 45 plus dollars per square foot. So you've got this disequilibrium and how do you convince a building owner to go [inaudible] it's pretty tough. So we are going to have to find some way to create an environment where it becomes possible to make that a good economic development decision. So I shared this about the feedback that we got. Why do we care so much about retail? It comes down to four things. It animates, it provides programming for the center city while creating jobs. It strengthens the demand for office because it creates a better environment. It serves the residents but it also captures the income of everybody that comes to town. It's almost like a manufacturing facility that exports and brings that entire margin back to town. So we are working to improve the retail environment. There are three specific things we are working on right now. In addition to the studies that are under way and the strategies we are forming. We are trying to form these strategies so that we can find that developer who is ready to come to town and be a part of the new project and begin to plant those seeds and prove the market, but it's parking strategies. We are working on some digital signage in the kiosks on Tryon Street to better support our guests and better connect them to things that they want. This is one of the things we have heard from retailers and then incubating new concepts. Our public market has incubated 21 new businesses and its official launch was last May. But those businesses are struggling to find their own. They did \$100K in sales in December. We are talking about putting newsstands on Tryon Street. We are just trying to get somebody on the street in commerce and get people used to shopping. We had a retail consultant say that you have to take back Saturday. You have to get it so that people say I'm going uptown

and what's incorporated into that is the shopping. They are not going to drive past to a mall to do it, you shop at the mall. But when you want a series of things to do, you shop ...

Ms. Mayfield said thinking about how we continue to make Charlotte a designation spot and looking at some of what we don't have but highlighting what we do. Are we having any conversations as far as City Center Partners looking how you are going to tie in what the development of the outlet that is going coming in the Steel Creek area because that is going to be bringing a lot more tourists into the area and some of those people are going to actually be visiting for long weekends staying at uptown. So are we having conversations now about the most convenient way through public transportation, shuttle, however to get them from uptown to the shopping experience and back to uptown?

Mr. Smith said we are working with Tom Murray and CATS and trying to think about the White Water Center. I think that that shopping will be like the White Water Center.

Ms. Mayfield said I hope not. A large number of people love the WWC. I have a lot of residents that don't and I think it's difficult to get to for a lot of people so that's why I'm saying I hope not as far as the difficulty of accessing it if you don't have private transportation. So I'm thinking about that tourist piece where we are trying to be more marketable and being a destination. I want to make sure that we are at least having those conversations to think about how to tie in the southend with the Steele Creek area as opposed to them having to make a decision where if you are out of the outlet then you are going to stay at the hotels that are there and you might not get a chance to see the beauty and the diversity we have in uptown or vice versa.

Mr. Smith said I'll reach out to them.

Ms. Fallon said the Gold Rush would be perfect. It's cute and takes you back and forth.

Mr. Smith said we will have to do a study. CATS will be a good source [audible]

Ms. Fallon said you can come back at night for the theatre.

Mr. Howard said the whole retail thing is something that I've been talking to you about. One being is that you go to places like Washington D.C. and even New York you really can't tell that there is ... at the top... because really so much of your attention is really going at street level. In Charlotte, we did it differently. WE have these great buildings with these wonderful lobbies so it's really clear as to what you are looking at. I was talking to Deborah about this. Looking at the way our zoning classifications were about requiring a certain amount of retail space on the lobby level but normally what happens because of this tradition of having these grand lobbies, we stick it in the back like they did in the Duke Energy Building on Church Street. It's never one of those things that draw you in from Tryon Street and we want to make sure that we retrofit where you can and correct the buildings as we start to talk to future developers.

The second thing has to do with what I thought at the time and still think when I went out with the Planning Commission and went to Brevard Street plan. The kind of feeling I got between Hall of Fame and the Arena and how we put real energy to it. Again, we spoke about it and kind of thought that we needed the Epicenter to stay strong ... a lot of competition. But I was wondering if it's time now to go back to Simmons or some of those other people and talk about a three P approach to doing at Brevard Street and instead clubs make more shopping between them, at least for a couple of those blocks. In having an intentional conversation about trying to induce that because if not, I'm not sure how the Brevard Street Plan will ever really happen and it may solve that whole destination retail experience kind of more the Rodeo Drive kind of experience as opposed to just another Epic Center but just laid out. [inaudible] the live projects was what I thought it should be but maybe it's more of a shopping experience—kind of an outdoor mall feel. I think that there is great potential at the Brevard Street Plan and would like to see some energy around that.

Mr. Smith said I agree, I think that the Stonewall offers some unique opportunities. South Tryon is strong. I think Brevard is strong. I think the first couple of blocks off the square and at

College and Trade Street. These are all great areas that could offer a lot of potential for new developer.

Mr. Howard said it's also the way that those side streets work. I kind of got out and walked the streets at night and realized that kind of treat all streets except Tryon and Trade as kind of fetus at Trade and Tryon. Even at night and with the sidewalk lamps it feels like it's really more to get to someplace and it's not part of the experience. I know we spend a lot of time working on College and Church to make them not feel like accessory streets but they still do. Then there is the numeric streets running east and west definitely feel that way. I just wonder if you put any thought into making every street feel like an experience and not just all those leading to Trade and Tryon.

Mr. Smith said I think the idea of having the entire uptown [inaudible]. I think as we see that redeveloped there are two components in the 20/20 vision plan that do exactly that. The first is the Boulevard Loop which is Stonewall to about 11<sup>th</sup> 12<sup>th</sup> over ... and make it a grand boulevard that you. The other is that connects the parks of the four wards. The idea behind that one is a great street that you wouldn't want to drive but that you would walk or bike or run it. It's almost an extension of the parks and creates a city in the park was the concept.

Mr. Howard said I would like to get this to the level that it can come to a committee so we could start working through the ordinances that you'll need to change. So maybe to get to that point I would hope that you guys come there so we can start that process in earnest.

Mayor Foxx said I haven't looked at the 20/20 Plan extensively but the plan for East and West Trade Street and what we envision that to be, I've never been exactly clear on what the goal is there given the direction from Council last week, I think there is an opportunity to really aggressively involve CCP in envisioning that corridor.

Mr. Smith said [inaudible] that's going to be another ... because big cities don't put houses on ... it's the city bank tower in Chicago. People come in you get off and get in an elevator and go to work. That's the kind of opportunity... I think you're right that we need to get ... there was some good work done on ... for West Trade all the way out to Johnson C. Smith. [Inaudible]

Mayor Foxx said I say that to say that as you are looking at all these things retail, office, residential, I think we have been Tryon Street centric in the way that we have focused on downtown and that's not to say that other things haven't happened around downtown. Clearly they have. But there is no mistaking when you are riding downtown what the main strip is and I think the next street that probably the sense is Trade Street and really paying some real attention to how that street develops so that we have retail on it. We have commercial office uses on it, we have residential on it and it's not like there is not anything there already. There are some things already there. We just need to build on it and I think that's a real opportunity for our city. Because if we can grow east west and fill out the downtown, that's only going to work towards the benefit of our center city.

Mr. Smith said lastly, there is the 60,000 sq. ft. of soft goods retail uptown of the 164 MM sf. Again that is trying to create that natural bridge so that it can become a naturally occurring retail environment.

Mayor Foxx asked have we formally engaged plans on East West Trade Street.

Mr. Smith said Part of the urban plan effort [inaudible]. There are plans for the Third Ward. [Inaudible] I don't remember a lot of details.

Mayor Foxx said it's been a while. Ron I know you've got some interest in taking a look at the planning elements of this but I think it's time to engage so that there is not just transit component but there is actually an economic development planning component that people actually feel close enough to so I would love to ask you and Michael to get together and start hammering out what the process for that would like.

**City Manager Ron Carlee** said we will do that. That was actually, as part of our last review, to begin identifying some specific areas for us to focus on strategically.

Mr. Howard said to that end, you make another good point. Michael we spoke about this too. And that is how starting to pull the energy from the colleges to gather on something. This kind of touches Central Piedmont, Johnson & Whales, Johnson C. Smith and all those things in between will kind of lend itself to certain types of retail opportunities; certain type of collaboratives—joint student unions even a joint bookstore. There would be some interest and opportunities to pull those synergies together as well. I was telling Michael about what's known in Atlanta was the quad between Clark, Morehouse and Spellman. They share a library. They share different things. It would be real smart to figure out how we can have that capacity as well as a part of this conversation.

\* \* \* \* \*

## **TREE CANOPY**

**Gina Shell, TreeCharlotte** said I'm glad to be here to talk about the success of TreeCharlotte. As to the background, the tree canopy goal does link back to the environment focus area plan for council. In 2010 we had our last tree canopy analysis. At that time the City of Charlotte was 46% covered by tree canopy. The city and its ETJ was 49% covered. We continue to believe that we are the best treed city among the 20 most popular cities in the country. In 2010, city council approved an increased annual budget for tree planting (\$700K) and in 2011 the 50% canopy in 2050 was adopted.

The purpose of setting that goal was to create a rallying cry for the community. Everyone recognizes that trees are one of our greatest natural resources here in Charlotte, but this really solidified that. It provided us a benchmark in something for the community to aim for and also gave us a signal of whether we were succeeding.

On the city side of the tree work, we have about 180,000 street trees and we continue to try to get all those inventoried so that we know continuously what's there and the state of those trees. We have about 145,000 of those inventoried at this time. We planted 1100 new street trees this year and those were either replacements for trees that had been removed previously or we were able to go into one or two neighborhoods and tree those neighborhoods for the first time. 300 street trees were removed due to age or disease. 5000 street trees were pruned. Our medium and large trees we try to prune around every three to five years which is an industry standard but we also look to citizens to let us know if a tree needs to be pruned in the right-of-way and we banded 6,000 street trees for cankerworms this year.

As to a few other accomplishments, we discussed tree canopy and it was a focus of the Park/Woodlawn Area Plan. Our arborist Don Sween, who is here does a lot of educational outreach, particularly this year on Cankerworm and the tree legacy. We initiated an Urban Forestry management plan. We did initiate a new tree canopy analysis and will be back to you with those statistics in late summer or early fall. We were named a "Top Ten Urban Forest" by American Forests and we were featured in the media a number of times, but one feature that we were actually asked to write was for the Journal of the Society of Municipal Arborists so I included that here.

Some of the deliverables from Dave Cable for us this year included some media coverage, an effective website, the plantings that we wanted to happen through TreeCharlotte; an action summit which we had just last week which was attended by about 50 folks interested in trees was a very good event; and to secure additional partners planned for the next year.

I do want to mention that there's a lot of City staff internal collaboration around trees now and the Tree Charlotte initiative in particular. In addition to Engineering and Property Management, Neighborhood and Business Services has been a close partner this year because we have developed our NeighborWoods program which is the program where we plant in neighborhoods under the umbrella of neighborhood matching grants. Planning has been a great partner especially in the area plan initiative. CDOT has been a partner with our street trees; Corporate

Communications with the website and other media initiatives. I've probably left folks out but those are some key internal partners. I like to offer this quote. This was from Dave Cable's report to us last year because I think it captures so well our aspirations for the tree canopy.

**Dave Cable, TreeCharlotte** said I am really proud of what we've been able to do and what I wanted to tonight is to share with you a little about what our accomplishments have been and where we are headed for the year ahead. If I had a slide up that summarizes what has gone on in the last 11 months, this would be it. We've nailed all or targets and all the numbers are great. There have been some learnings that have surfaced and one of them is the profound engagement opportunity that this project affords. We get a lot of testimonials after the events that hold and I would say about 50% of the testimonials are we love our trees, it's great for our neighbor, but then the other 50% of those testimonials relate to this is the first time we've ever rallied around something. We've gotten together with our neighbors—we're doing something in the community. So I am a huge believer in this project for all sorts of different reasons; Sustainability in our community; it's a great thing for the environment; it is a fabulous social capital building tool. I think we are really on to something here. That is one of the learnings is the community engagement piece of this has been profound. The two other learnings as I have been in this space a tree canopy is truly a profound resource. It is an extraordinary asset for this community and it isn't just going be here and if we are not thoughtful about it 20 30 40 years from now. We have to be very thoughtful in diversifying the canopy, dealing with our aging geriatric canopy and we've got a real problem too in that the trees aren't always where the people and what TreeCharlotte is all about this connection point and the enjoyment in the aesthetic appeal, the property values, the environmental benefits that fall to people who interaction with trees. So we've got a great canopy. We've got profound community engagement and we really are one to something here. So I'm excited about it. It's an honor to share this with you. This is a great project for me to be involved in. I really believe in it in a very profound way and I am delighted to be here tonight.

We couldn't be where we are without you and your support. And we couldn't be where we are without the collaborative that we have with the City that is very unique and we also couldn't be where we are without the support of the private sector and some of these sponsors that we're really thankful for. They are strong supporters. It's growing all the time. This is an easy sell. This is something that people can relate to and understand. So we've had a lot of interest on the part of the philanthropic community and I expect that to grow and we are very grateful to these organizations and people for supporting us.

I want to just give you a little bit of a level set here and refresh your memory on the origins of TreeCharlotte, what our mission is; the collaborative part of this is unique. It's something that relationship of public and private capital in working across a variety of not only City Agencies/organizations but non-profit organizations and for profit agencies.

We talked a little bit our accomplishments in some level of detail. Talk about our goals and just a little bit about funding. Just to refresh your memory, you may recall the origins of TreeCharlotte were the convergence of two rails. In one rail you were responsible for and that is the study that was done on the canopy, the increase in funding, the increase in the tree ordinance and then the adoption of the goal. That goal was an important rallying point for the community and it worked. So that goal was a very important piece of where we are today (50% goal). The other rail that merged with that to give both to TreeCharlotte was the initiative that was started by the Knight Foundation and a couple really concerned great community leader, one of which is here tonight, Marsha Simmon. She is co-chair of the board and she has given tirelessly to this project over the last two years. My biggest responsibility and difficult challenge is keeping up with Marsha. She is a great leader and we are really lucky to have her. She and Susan Patterson got together early on with Ralph Neil and really started to drive this community gathering together on what we can do about the tree canopy. Those two initiates, your initiative and the goal and the leadership from the city and the private sector came together through the Knight Foundation to form TreeCharlotte and that really was born at the first action summit that was held a year ago. We just had the second action summit last week. It's a public/private collaborative. I happen to think it's an incredibly efficient entrepreneurial business model. Everything we do is science-based—the right tree in right place. This is people like Don and the arbor staff—the great talents that we have in the city guiding this project. This is not a willy-nilly

lets go out and plant a bunch trees. This is a project that I think will increase the survivability of the trees that we plant and in a very intentional way we will expand the diversity of the canopy over time. So that science-base is very important and it is a nationally significant model and being tracked kind of program across the country. That goal is 50%. The canopy is a living organism so we don't know what's going to happen between now and 2050. We are going to lose some trees to development. We are going to have some trees saved because of the tree ordinance. We could have another hurricane like Hugo come through and have incredible damage. So there are all kinds of things that could happen but based on everything that we've looked at. It looks like we need to plant an additional roughly 15,000 trees a year to meet that canopy goal and that's what TreeCharlotte has taken on as its challenge. The City has already committed between 8,000 and 10,000 trees but there is a gap of about 15,000 trees and that's what our goal is.

The second profound conclusion that we came to is that there really is not enough public land to meet the goal so automatically that involves the private sector private land and that has a whole array of issues associated with it and we have learned a lot in working in that private space. Lastly, residential subdivisions do hold the greatest promise to expand the canopy. Again, if we think about not just planting a bunch of trees to meet the canopy goal and check it off our list but if we think about the importance of this connection point between people and trees, then residential subdivisions really do hold great promise.

The governance structure – foundation for the Carolinas is a key partner in this collaborative. The TreeCharlotte Foundation is housed at the foundation. We did not form a new non-profit organization, so this part of the story of the efficiency of this model. So we are housed at Foundation for the Carolinas and employed by both the City and the Board. I report to both. The funds sit at the foundation. We have a board that oversees that fund which is co-chaired by Marsha and Johnny Harris. We work very closely with the City to coordinate this project. We do it in a way that provides leadership to these various programs that are listed down at the bottom. NeighborWoods is where we go into neighborhoods and we plant a lot of trees. You've heard a lot about Creek ReLeaf over the years. That is a reforestation effort along stream banks and in reality as the program grows, there could be 40 boxes across the bottom here that would be energized and funded and help led by the TreeCharlotte initiative as a collaborative.

We are fortunate in that both Marsha and Johnny Harris got involved in this project early and took it on to bring about key leadership and all of you know the importance of a Board. I have been kicking around the non-profit community in Charlotte for a while and I am really honored to be working with this Board. This is a fantastic group of people and Anthony thank you for your service on the Board and Marsha, of course, for your service and we are hoping that Ron would play well on this Board also over time. But this is a wonderful board. This is a great representation of this community and some key leaders in the community that will help with our success.

As to accomplishments—these were the projects that we ticked off this year. We planted in total a collaborative of about 4,000 trees; about 1,200 of those were in the NeighborWoods settings with volunteers. Thank you for coming out LaWana to plant trees. Your relationship with someone really changes when you actually plant a tree with them. I have found and I have had the great joy of doing that with several people in this room.

The trees that we are planting are not small trees and are not the city sized street trees. They are called containerized trees. They are seven to 15 gallon trees. They are between 6-7 feet tall and maybe 12 feet tall. So they are big enough so that when we leave the neighborhood and the volunteers look over their shoulder at the end of the day, they really know they did something. They are not so big that Anthony, you couldn't handle one.

This is a summary of the projects that we have completed. Next year we are going try and double down on this number. We have met those planting goals. The board was established over the last 11 months; we raised the first \$130,000 that we needed to get the program really up and running from private sector fundraising. We established a lot of partners. As you can see, the list here and it almost grows weekly. This is truly a collaborative. This is not a TreeCharlotte or City of Charlotte soviet style plan about the future of the canopy. This is really

a collaborative that is functioning very affectively. We had our second action summit and then we launched the website with the help from the City and we are hoping that this really will be the go to place for all things trees in Charlotte. We've gotten some good activity on this site. It is pretty well laid out. We are always interested in feedback but so far it has been well-received and we hope to populate it further as time goes on.

Ms. Mayfield said as we are looking at the areas that we are identifying through our tree save and we are planning also to go back and looking at areas that currently have trees because I'm getting a number of calls from constituents throughout my district that our growth is now causing some obstruction when it comes to seeing the stop sign or being able to see oncoming traffic or having to go a little bit further out passed the stop sign into the way in order to be able to get a better gauge of traffic patterns while driving and that is because a lot of the trees have now grown to maturity or they are in that process and noticing also for walkers/cyclers that don't have a bike lane yet. You are seeing a lot of trees that have—I think there is a disconnect as far as what falls into TreeCharlotte as far as maintenance, what falls on the City, and what falls under homeowner. So there might be some kind area to look educational component to help people to realize where does this fall in order to make sure that it's maintained because you are starting to have a lot of trees where just from the leaves growing its also causing obstruction when they are walking along the sidewalks or riding their bicycles. So with everything that is already happening with TreeCharlotte, which you know I'm a major fan, I just wonder if there is a way to have a conversation about the educational component. What falls into what category? I think it would be helpful for council as well to get a better understanding if there is anyone on council that doesn't know, I'm only going to speak for myself what falls into homeowner, TreeCharlotte, City of Charlotte.

Mr. Cable said it's a great point and education is really the underpinnings of what this program is all about. We want to plant a bunch of trees but 50% of our mission is protecting and helping to manage the trees that we have. That is a really important piece. Don runs the street tree program and if we can use TreeCharlotte to message into the community clarity on the understanding of whose responsible for what and for those trees that fall on private property, what folks can do to properly manage those, that will be done.

Ms. Fallon said I've got a number of calls from people who were very upset because of the cankerworms that parts of the city were taken care of and their part of the City was not taken care and when they asked and I called, I found out that they ran out of money. That's not fair. Why only one side of the City and the other, who is very treed, is having a big problem. The money should be split so that everything is taken of.

Ms. Shell said we have banded trees around the city. There also had been some money available through Neighborhood and Business Services for some neighborhood tree banding and that may have been what they referred to as having run out. We are going to put a small amount of funding back into that so that there will be opportunities for neighborhoods to apply again and we will work with Neighborhood and Business Services to publicize that.

Mayor Foxx said I think she also may be referring to the spraying that was done a few years ago. Whether the spraying hit the entire City or whether it was targeted.

Ms. Fallon said this was basically Rozelles Ferry, Valley Dale. That area and I got number of calls from them and they were very unhappy because they said other places got it but they got nothing.

**Don McSween, Arborist** said the selection of the area for the aerial spraying was done very scientifically by putting out monitoring traps throughout the city and then we used that as a basis to determine where the high population was and to target that area for spraying. Since that time, there have been other areas outside of the original 40% of the city that was sprayed—over 65,000 acres at a cost of \$1.5MM. So those areas outside now the populations are increasing in those areas. So they are saying because they-re a nuisance, they want the spray.

Ms. Fallon said well they were heavily infested because I went and looked.

Mr. McSween said I have too. Yes ma'am. But we are saying that we base that on the cost of the trees, not just as a nuisance value because we have to get approval from Federal and State Agencies in order to be able to do this.

Mr. Cable said I know we are running short so I'm going run through this quickly, but I put a couple of representative slides up here for the kinds of projects that we did. This was one of our first ones. It was December and we were in drought conditions. It was tough but we got through it and this was Crescent Resources sponsored project. They put up money to buy the trees. We coordinated the event. They provided the volunteers along with Queens and some folks from the hospital and we planted 293 trees on the Southside communities—Charlotte Housing Authority site—in a couple of hours. It was a great event and a great way to kick off our year.

In Little Rock community we have a great relationship with Charlotte Housing Authority. This was another project that was sponsored by the hospital. They provided 186 volunteers and they were done in about 1.5 hours. In the north end of town, General Point has a really great community organization. One thing I wanted to point out here is that in the upper left hand corner, for every project we do, there is a scientifically based blueprint that is put together for that neighborhood that involves the neighborhood and the arborist to identify what trees are to go where and what kind of trees ought to be put there. We use it as an engagement tool with the community that is quite effective and it's an important step in the process.

Lastly, LaWana this is one that you were involved in. On southside, Park Uptown Rotary sponsored we planted 21/22 trees on a drizzly cold partially snowy February/March day, but it was a lot of fun and typical of the kinds of events that we have been doing. We have had some decent media coverage. Most significantly, was a mention in the USA Today when Charlotte was really highlighted as one of the best canopied cities in America and our themes for 2014 moving into our goals for next year. We didn't really talk too much about our story last year, now it's really time to tell the story because have something to talk about. So we are moving from quietly going about business engaging the communities and doing a lot of great work to telling that story and we also want to in a full-fledged way really launch an educational program that we really haven't done. We have been focusing in on engaging the community to plant trees. We need to move into an area where we are teaching people about tree care because that is an important piece of this. We've got some fundraising to do. We are starting a new concept called Tree Stores, where we are going into some of the closed in areas that don't necessarily need a ton of trees but they are really interested in participating in the program and the way I described this as a kid, I always used the bookmobile. We didn't have a library in the school and the bookmobile would come around a couple of times a weeks. Well this is going to be a tree mobile that comes into a neighborhood at a cul-de-sac and it won't take a lot of energy to pull this off but this is like a Grier Heights, McCrory Heights. Those kinds of neighborhoods that really want to participate but don't want to do a full-fledged canopy initiative.

So those are some of the things that we are looking to really institutionalize the project as we move forward into our second year. We are saying 10,-000 trees for next year, which that is a major stretch goal for us and we are kind of bumping up against resource limitations in doing but instead of 1200 trees we are going to do almost 2800 trees in those NeighborWood settings. So again, this will be massive community engagement. One of the first projects is going to be in the McIntyre neighbor, near Northlake Mall. We are going to try and do 500 trees in that event. The leadership there is fabulous in that community so I am optimist that we will be successful.

This is an overview of our budget for FY14 and I put this in here just to show you the blending of public and private capital. We've got a private capital goal that Marsha and Johnny Harris are leading to raise about \$330,000 and with that the city will bring about \$360,000 to bring about this 10,000 tree initiative. So it's good on a lot of different fronts. It's a great honor and joy to be involved in this and I appreciate the opportunity to share it with you.

Ms. Shell said no vote or action is needed at this time. We will just continue with our work. We will bring the analysis back to you in a few months and we will bring any other contracts or approvals to you as necessary.

Mr. Dulin said Ms. Simon thank you for leading with your time and your money.

Mayor Foxx said yes, thank you. It's a wonderful endeavor.

\* \* \* \* \*

## **CITIZEN'S FORUM**

### **Requesting a Grant for North Carolina Gang Investigators Association**

**Sandra Huerta, 11209 Brittany Oaks Dr.** said I am the bereaved mother and a victim's advocate for North Carolina Gang Investigators Association (NCGIA). My 21 year old son was killed by a two strike felon and gang member nine years ago. The killer was later acquitted because he claimed that he blacked out at the moment he was stabbing my son. After years of struggling trying to survive his death and the acquittal, I finally determined to do something positive with my grief, to give back to the community and support groups that helped me along the way. I joined the NCGIA a couple of years ago as a victims advocate and I recently wrote a book called "Tears of Sorrow" to try to give back to the community but also to provide an avenue other bereaved individuals that may find themselves in the same spot that I was in nine years ago and with that I thought of building a victims \_\_\_ for the North Tryon Gang Investigators to give back to some of the victims in ways of offering them financial services to attend some of the national conferences that are offered for grief support to the parents of murdered children. In The Compassionate Friends of Charlotte and CMPD Homicide Support Group, The goal would be \$25,000 for the victims fund for this year and that would provide the victims the financial assistance they would need to attend the national conference which would encompass their flight if it is out of town, the hotel stay and the three intensive workshop that allows them specific areas of grief that they could go and get counseling from and work with other victims and other survivors, specifically in that type of loss. So whether it is homicide, murder, suicide, it would specifically be tailored to that type of loss. So I am donating part of the proceeds of the sale of my book and during the conference, the NCGIA conference in August, to try to find sponsors to match my donations to get to that \$25,000 goal. I am also seeking a grant from the City of Charlotte to help us meet that goal for the 2013 conference which actually lines very well the PR of ....children is in August and the NCGIA also is in August.

Mayor Foxx said we are very sorry for your loss and appreciate your willingness to get engaged and to try to make life better for those who follow you. In terms of the request, I know that several members of the council support organizations for parents that have had various losses and I know Mr. Howard in particular.

Mr. Howard said I understand. I helped with the group, Mothers of Murdered Offspring, when we formed 20 years ago. I'm trying to do the exact same thing and one of the things that came to mind while you were speaking was that the Governor's Crime Commission was a place that we actually sought assistance from when we were trying to get going. It's just a lengthy process. I think council used to get involved with the group, Stop the Killing, but so many different groups started to come and pushing us to look at other sources that were set up for this type of thing.

Ms. Huerta said what makes the NC Gang Investigative Association unique in their approach is they are primarily focused on gang prevention, intervention and reentry programs. Their intent was to provide the victim's aspect resource to the survivors so it's not to just approach the violence in itself but to also provide an avenue for the victims to find additional resources from a victim's survivor so that is why now I am endeavoring to try and find resources for them. Having gone through the different support group systems and counseling sessions, I know firsthand how hard it is to even nine years later suffering from nightmares from such a loss.

Mayor Foxx said I think we should probably ask the manager to engage the Police department and see if there is something that can be worked out on this. It's not something that we would be in a position to solve for tonight but we'll ask the City Manager to follow-up with you on that. That is our final speaker and so we will stand adjourned.

Meeting adjourned 7:48pm

June 3, 2013  
Council Workshop  
Minute Book 135, Page 24

---

Stephanie C. Kelly, City Clerk

Length of Meeting: 2 hour, 27 minutes  
Minutes Completed: August 9, 2013