



Approved January 13, 2010

## HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

### MINUTES

December 9, 2009

MEMBERS PRESENT: Mr. Jonathan Crotty, Chair  
Ms. Debra Glennon  
Mr. Greg Grueneich  
Ms. Lucia Griffith  
Ms. Barbara Highfill  
Mr. Jeff Koenig  
Mr. John Phares  
Mr. Dominick Ristaino  
Mr. Damon Rumsch  
Ms. Karen Rush

MEMBERS ABSENT: Ms. Mary Ellen George, Vice Chair

OTHERS PRESENT:           Mr. John Rogers, Administrator  
  Historic District Commission  
  
  Mrs. Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the  
  Historic District Commission  
  
  Mr. Mujeeb Shah-Khan, Assistant City Attorney

With a quorum present, Chairman Crotty called the regular December meeting of the HDC to order at 3:10 pm. He began the meeting with a welcome to all in attendance and by swearing in those present (and continued to do so throughout the meeting as others arrived). Due to the quasi-judicial nature of the Commission, staff and others who may speak are sworn in at every meeting. (Commissioners are sworn in by the City Clerk for the length of the appointment at the beginning of each term.) Mr. Crotty asked that everyone in attendance please sign in and when addressing the Commission to please state name and address for the record. Mr. Crotty explained the meeting process. The review of each application consists of two parts. The first is the presentation portion. Staff presents the application then Commissioners and those speaking on behalf of the application will discuss the project. Next, members of the audience will be asked if anyone present wishes to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application. Again, there will be an opportunity for comments and questions from the Commission and the applicant. The second part is the discussion and deliberation portion of the meeting. At this point, discussion of the application is limited to the Commission members and staff only. Unless the Commission votes to re-open the meeting to ask additional questions or for clarification of some issue, the applicant and audience members do not participate in this portion of the discussion. Once discussion is complete, a MOTION will be made to APPROVE, DENY, or DEFER and a vote will be taken. A simple majority vote of those Commissioners present is required for a decision. Mr. Crotty asked that all cell

phones and any other electronic devices be either turned off completely, or set to silent operation. He also asked that any Commissioner announce, for the record, their arrival and/or departure when this takes place during the meeting.

Index of Addresses:	1919 The Plaza	Plaza Midwood
	607 Mt .Vernon Ave.	Dilworth
	225 E. Worthington Ave.	Dilworth
	1812 Cleveland Ave.	Dilworth
	600 E. Tremont Ave.	Dilworth

Application: 1919 The Plaza – Addition/Renovation.

This application to transform what looks like a brick ranch house was deferred last month for further design study. The house actually was once a Spanish Eclectic design discovered by evidence seen in the attic. The proposal is to add a second story and return Spanish Colonial elements. This was previously approved by the Commission but a change new includes an additional rear room on the second floor where a cut out was shown.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Mr. Crotty’s invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

Applicant Comments: Applicant Angie Lauer said the design accentuates the style but takes away the “mixture” that the Commission found problematic. Revised plans show parapet wall, tile, and stucco. When the house was renovated in the 1950s and brick was added over the stucco.

MOTION: Based on ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Rumsch made a MOTION to approve the plans with all exterior walls to be stucco and the roof to be red slate-like architectural shingles (longer dimension such as Slate Line). Staff will review revised plans. Mr. Phares seconded.

VOTE: 8/0/1      AYES: CROTTY, GLENNON, GRUENEICH, HIGHFILL, KOENIG, PHARES, RISTAINO, RUMSCH

NAYS: NONE

ABSTAIN: RUSH

DECISION: ADDITION APPROVED WITH STAFF TO REVIEW REVISIONS.

---

Application:      607 Mt. Vernon Avenue – Paint Brick.

This 1 ½ story brick house has a rear addition that was past approved by the HDC with the note that “materials will match existing”. The addition fills in a cut out and definitely does not match but is very obvious. New owners propose to paint the house to unify and blend the facades.

Applicant Comments: Owners, Mr. and Mrs. Geesling, said the addition uses some reclaimed brick but it appears they ran out on the side. Their mason has said that the brick is not longer made.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Mr. Crotty's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on the need for further study regarding any alternatives that may be out there rather than painting all the brick (staining, cleaning the mortar, etc.) Mr. Rumsch made a MOTION to DEFER the application for painting the brick house. Mr. Grueneich seconded. Mr. Phares added that a close in exhibit would be helpful for future considerations.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: CROTTY, GLENNON, GRUENEICH, HIGHFILL, KOENIG, PHARES, RISTAINO, RUMSCH, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: APPLICATION DEFERRED FOR FURTHER RESEARCH ON ALTERNATIVES TO PAINTING BRICK.

---

Application: 225 East Worthington Avenue – Façade Changes.

This new office building was approved by the HDC several years ago. The proposed plan shows two sets of windows on the front being converted to French

doors. To the left, an outdoor patio (accessed by one of the two new sets of French doors) will be added and fenced in with stone piers spanned by wooden fence rails and landscaped in a small planting strip around the outer edge.

---

Ms. Griffith arrived at 4:00 pm and was present for the remainder of the meeting.

---

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Ms. Griffith made a MOTION to APPROVE the changes and addition as presented. Ms. Rush seconded.

VOTE: 9/1            AYES: CROTTY, GLENNON, GRUENEICH, HIGHFILL, KOENIG, PHARES, RISTAINO, RUSH

NAYS: RUMSCH

DECISION: CHANGES AND ADDITION APPROVED.

---

Application:            1812 Cleveland Avenue – House Relocation.

Two houses exist on the site of recently approved Dilworth Inn to be constructed on East Boulevard. The developers said they would try to find an alternative to demolition for one or both of the houses. This application is for the relocation of one of the houses to an adjacent lot that faces Cleveland Avenue. One of the houses is original Dilworth housing stock the other is a 1980s new



This two story brick house sits on the corner of East Tremont and where Winthrop Avenue is stubbed off. It was once a duplex but was converted to single family. An older one story addition exists to the left on the front. An addition atop this old addition was approved by the Commission in recent years. "Details and materials to match existing" is understood unless otherwise discussed. This upper fill-in addition does not match very well. Other places on the house in need of some sort of unification are (1) a full basement level that is painted cement block, (2) a corner that has settled and been badly repaired and still needs to be repaired.

FOR/AGAINST: Based on the need for further design study, Ms. Rush made a MOTION to DEFER the application. Ms. Griffith seconded.

VOTE: 10/0 AYES: CROTTY, GLENNON, GRUENEICH, GRIFFITH, HIGHFILL, KOENIG, PHARES, RISTAINO, RUMSCH, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: APPLICATION TO PAINT BRICK HOUSE DEFERRED.

---

Ms. Griffith said she reported to the Planning Commission that the ***Policy & Design Guidelines*** changes and clarifications and clean up had been approved. A question arose as to the amount of public input there had been during the process. Mr. Rogers explained that State Statute gives the presumption of expertise to a Commission and charges it to develop its Guidelines. The HDC has done this.



Mr. Phares reported that at a recent AIA meeting he had the gift of hearing a presentation by the great grandson of Louis Asbury. Many Asbury buildings still stand in Charlotte. It was a great 20 minute presentation that he suggested would be good for a future retreat agenda.

Mr. Rogers said he has cool news. Over the past 2-3 years there has an initiative to rewrite the Urban Street Guidelines creating 'complete streets' – motor, bike, transit, pedestrian. It is time to begin implementation.

A MOTION was made, seconded, and the vote was unanimous to APPROVE the November Minutes as distributed. Any changes or corrections will be reported to Mrs. Birmingham.

The meeting adjourned at 4:50 with a meeting length of 1 hour and 40 minutes.

---

Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the Historic District Commission