

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

MINUTES

December 12, 2012

MEMBERS PRESENT: Dr. Lili Corbus  
Mr. Don Duffy  
Mr. Tom Egan  
Ms. I-Mei Ervin  
Ms. Mary Ellen George, Chair  
Ms. Debra Glennon, 2<sup>nd</sup> Vice Chair  
Mr. Tom Low  
Mr. Dominick Ristaino, Vice Chair  
Ms. Lisa Yarbrough

MEMBERS ABSENT: One Vacancy  
Mr. Roger Dahnert  
Mr. Brad Norvell

OTHERS PRESENT: Ms. Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the  
Historic District Commission  
Mr. Thomas Powers, Assistant City Attorney  
Ms. Laura Harmon, Assistant Planning Director

Ms. Karen Robinson, Administrative Officer

Charlotte Mecklenburg Planning Department

With a quorum present Chairman George called the regular December meeting of the Historic District Commission to order at 3:10 pm. She began the meeting with a welcome to all in attendance and by swearing in those present (and continued to do so throughout the meeting as others arrived). Due to the quasi-judicial nature of the Commission, staff and others who may speak are sworn in at every meeting. (Commissioners are sworn in by the City Clerk for the length of the appointment at the beginning of each term.) Ms. George asked that everyone in attendance please sign in and when addressing the Commission to please state name and address for the record. Ms. George explained the meeting process. The review of each application consists of two parts. The first is the presentation portion. Staff presents the application then Commissioners and those speaking on behalf of the application discuss the project. Next members of the audience will be asked if anyone present wishes to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application. Again there will be an opportunity for comments and questions from the Commission and the applicant. The second part of the discussion and deliberation portion of the meeting. At this point, discussion of the application is limited to the Commission members and staff only. Unless the Commission votes to re-open the meeting to ask additional questions or for clarification of some issue, the applicant and audience members do not participate in this portion of the discussion. Once discussion is complete, a MOTION will be made to APPROVE, DENY, or DEFER and a vote will be taken. A simple majority vote of those Commissioners present is required for a decision. Ms. George asked that all cell phones and any other electronic devices be turned off completely or set to silent operation. She also asked that any Commissioner announce, for the record, their arrival and/or departure when this takes place during the meeting.

Ms. Birmingham introduced the new HDC Member, Tom Low. Mr. Low is the representative of the Planning Commission recently appointed by the Mayor.

Ms. Birmingham introduced Laura Harmon, Assistant Planning Director. Historic District Commission operation falls within her jurisdiction and she is in attendance to see how a meeting flows and is accomplished.

Ms. Birmingham explained Mr. Rogers' absence. He was in a car wreck on Thanksgiving morning as he headed home to see his parents in Columbia. His new car was totaled and he broke his hand and sternum. He will return to work next week.

|                     |                         |                |
|---------------------|-------------------------|----------------|
| Index of Addresses: | 500 East Tremont Avenue | Dilworth       |
|                     | 747 Romany Road         | Dilworth       |
|                     | 318 Walnut Avenue       | Wesley Heights |
|                     | 801 Berkeley Avenue     | Dilworth       |
|                     | 1003 Romany Road        | Dilworth       |
|                     | 2132 Charlotte Drive    | Dilworth       |
|                     | 716 East Boulevard      | Dilworth       |
|                     | 720 Walnut Avenue       | Wesley Heights |
|                     | 700 East Tremont Avenue | Dilworth       |
|                     | 1708 Thomas Avenue      | Plaza Midwood  |
|                     | 2137 Charlotte Drive    | Dilworth       |
|                     | 708 South Summit Avenue | Wesley Heights |
|                     | 231 West Park Avenue    | Wilmore        |

Application: 500 East Tremont Avenue – New Construction.

This c. 1925 house-converted-to-triplex is located at the corner of Tremont and Lyndhurst Avenues. It sits very low to the ground and there is a long

standing water problem in the immediate area. The Commission recently saw new construction plans with an attached garage. Further design study to detach the garage was recommended. Revised drawings show a detached garage. House details include exposed rafter tails, ½” or thicker siding with a 5 ¼” reveal, 5 ¼” corner boards, window subsills at least 1+”.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George’s invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines***, Mr. Ristaino made a MOTION to APPROVE the application with staff to see final plans that address all details. Mr. Duffy seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: CORBUS, GEORGE, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GLENNON, RISTAINO, YARBROUGH, LOW

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: STAFF MAY APPROVE REVISED PLANS WHICH SHOW ALL DETAILS.

---

Application: 747 Romany Road – Window Replacement.

This c. 1956 brick ranch has an unusual window pattern – three horizontal panes. The owner would like to remove all the windows and replace them with a traditional 1/1 double hung window. The Commission recently reviewed the proposal and deferred for more information.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George’s invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Window Replacement***, Mr. Duffy made a MOTION to approve the replacement

window pattern of 1/1 in concept. Details and additional photographs will come back to the full HDC for final approval.

VOTE: 7/2            AYES: CORBUS, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GLENNON,  
RISTAINO, LOW

NAYS: GEORGE, YARBROUGH

DECISION: REVISED PLANS WILL COME TO HDC FOR FINAL APPROVAL.

---

Application:            318 Walnut Avenue – Final Approval for House  
Relocation.

This c. 1932 house is located far back on its lot on the edge of the Wesley Heights Local Historic District. The Commission recently approved the pulling forward of the house to line up with other houses in the block, but final details and an plans for an addition were not approved at the time. Plans now show a small addition, the circular drive being removed, a straight drive added. Shakes will be removed from the gable ends and replaced with siding to match new and existing.

FOR/AGAINST:        No one accepted Ms. George’s invitation to speak either  
FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION:        Based on compliance with *Policy & Design Guidelines*, Mr. Duffy made a MOTION to APPROVE the house relocation details. New drive will extend beside the house to the back rear corner. House will line up with other single family houses in the block. Mr. Egan seconded.

VOTE: 9/0            AYES: CORBUS, GEORGE, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN,  
GLENNON, RISTAINO, YARBROUGH, LOW

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: HOUSE RELOCATION, DETAILS, DRIVE APPROVED.

---

Mr. Ristaino declared a conflict of interest and removed himself from the Commission for the next application.

---

Application: 801 Berkeley Avenue – Addition.

This c. 1927 home is located at the corner of Berkeley and Lafayette Avenues. It is a large house with Tudor details. Materials include a slate roof, brick and stucco, ½ timbering. Plans show a rear addition with materials and details to match the house.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on the need for further design study regarding the massing of the addition relative to the existing house, and the execution of Tudor detailing, Mr. Egan made a MOTION to DEFER the application. Ms. Ervin seconded.

VOTE: 8/0 AYES: CORBUS, GEORGE, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GLENNON, YARBROUGH, LOW

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: APPLICATION FOR A REAR ADDITION DEFERRED FOR FURTHER DESIGN STUDY.

---

Application: 1003 Romany Road – New Construction.

Located at Romany Road and Lexington Avenue, this new lot has been carved from the side yard of the adjacent house. The Commission has recently seen and deferred new construction plans. The site plan, setbacks, footprint, landscaping are yet to be resolved.

Applicant Comments: Builder Myles Gordon said the revised plans are well within the defined building footprint for this lot.

David Reule said considerable effort has been expended to address in revised plans every comment by the Historic District Commission and adjacent property owners.

FOR/AGAINST: Adjacent Property Owner Marcia Rouse spoke in opposition to the application.

Neighbor John Luke spoke in opposition to the application.

Adjacent Property Owner Keith Lehr spoke in opposition to the application.

Neighborhood Resident John Phares spoke in opposition to the application.

MOTION: Mr. Duffy made a MOTION to DEFER the application based on the need for two accurate streetscapes: Romany Road and Lexington Avenue. The project may come to Design Review with what has been submitted and with the new streetscapes and a recommendation will be made to the full Commission at the next meeting. Mr. Egan seconded.

VOTE: 9/0      AYES: CORBUS, GEORGE, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN,  
GLENNON, RISTAINO, YARBROUGH, LOW

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: APPLICATION DEFERRED FOR TWO STREETSCAPES.

NOTE: Mr. Powers pointed out as a reminder that the Design Review Meeting is a public meeting and the public may participate.

Design Review Committee to meet before Christmas: Mr. Duffy, Dr. Corbus, Mr. Ristaino, Mr. Low

---

Application:      2132 Charlotte Drive – Demolition.

This is a c. 1950 duplex is located at the intersection of Charlotte Drive and Dilworth Road West. It is one story brick with a porch/stoop facing each street.

Applicant Comments: This has been a rental for many years and has not always been kept up. It needs a lot of work. The plan is to demolish it and build something new – maybe a duplex or maybe single family. A large tree that is growing into the house will be lost.

FOR/AGAINST:      No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION:      Mr. Duffy made a MOTION to RECOGNIZE the duplex as CONTRIBUTING based on it being original neighborhood fabric, its siting, materials, building details, and scale. Ms. Glennon seconded.

VOTE: 9/0      AYES: CORBUS, GEORGE, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN,  
GLENNON, RISTAINO, YARBROUGH, LOW



NAYS: NONE

MOTION: Based on the building determined to be Contributing, Mr. Egan made a MOTION to impose the maximum 365-Day-Stay-of-Demolition. The policy to not hear an application for the new construction for 90 days is waived. Ms. Yarbrough seconded.

VOTE: 6/3            AYES: CORBUS, EGAN, GEORGE, LOW, RISTAINO,  
YARBROUGH

NAYS: DUFFY, ERVIN, GLENNON

DECISION: HOUSE DETERMINED TO BE CONTRIBUTING. MAXIMUM DELAY IMPOSED. 90-DAY NO-HEAR LIFTED.

---

Application:            716 East Boulevard – New Construction.

The previous building on this lot burned down back in the summer. It was a two story but the second story was within the roof. The new plans show a smaller footprint with a full second story. It will look like an office building. Materials include brick with limestone trim and base.

FOR/AGAINST:        No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – New Construction – Mass, Scale, Size*** and based on this being a commercial venture on a commercial street, Mr. Duffy made a MOTION to APPROVE the new office building. The urns shown on the renderings will remain a part of the facade. Ms. George seconded. Mr. Duffy and Ms. George accepted an amendment from Mr. Egan that the project is APPROVED in CONCEPT with details to come to staff for final approval.

VOTE: 7/2            AYES: CORBUS, GEORGE, DUFFY, ERVIN, RISTAINO,  
YARBROUGH, LOW

NAYS: ERVIN, GLENNON

DECISION: NEW BUILDING APPROVED IN CONCEPT.

---

Application:            720 Walnut Avenue – Garage.

A garage is proposed for this c. 1929 house. It will be a double garage with a garret and exterior stairway to the second floor with a shop space on the lower level. Materials and details will match house.

FOR/AGAINST:        No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION:        Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Accessory Structures***, Mr. Duffy made a MOTION to APPROVE the proposed garage. Mr. Egan seconded.

VOTE: 9/0            AYES: CORBUS, GEORGE, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN,  
GLENNON, RISTAINO, YARBROUGH, LOW

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: GARAGE APPROVED.

---

Application:            700 East Tremont Avenue – Addition.

This c. 1915 one and one-half story house is at the corner of East Tremont and Springdale Avenues. The addition plan maintains the front roofline with a two story rear addition to be to the back ½ of the house. The new addition will connect with a walkway to a new rear side-facing garage. Existing garage will be demolished. The front door will be reoriented to face the street. A new front stoop will be added in front of the house being pulled forward by enclosing the existing porch.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on the need to see plans for an addition that exhibits order and organization and relationship to the existing, Mr. Egan made a MOTION to DENY.

The motion died for lack of a second.

MOTION: Based on the need for further design study in the areas of mass, scale, detailing, order, and organization, Ms. Glennon made a MOTION to DEFER the application. Dr. Corbus seconded.

VOTE: 7/2            AYES: CORBUS, DUFFY, ERVIN, GLENNON, RISTAINO,  
YARBROUGH, LOW

NAYS: EGAN, GEORGE

DECISION: APPLICATION DEFERRED FOR FURTHER DESIGN STUDY.

---

Dr. Corbus declared a conflict of interest and removed herself from the Commission for the next application.

---

Application: 1708 Thomas Avenue – Accessory Building.

A garage-sized building is proposed for the back yard for additional living space. Brick piers will match the front of the house with offset columns. Other materials and details will match the existing house.

Applicant Comments: Architect Kraig Magas explained that there is a home based business using rooms in the house so additional living space is being created in the new building out back.

FOR/AGAINST: Adjacent Property Owner Allen Rauch spoke in opposition of the building and its use.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Accessory Structures***, Mr. Duffy made a MOTION to approve the new out building. Materials and details will match the house. Ms. Yarbrough seconded.

VOTE: 7/1            AYES: GEORGE, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GLENNON, RISTAINO, YARBROUGH

NAYS: LOW

DECISION: ACCESSORY BUILDING APPROVED.

---

Application: 2137 Charlotte Drive – Addition.

This is a one and one-half story brick house with cross gable roof and a front facing gable over the stoop and a pair of dormers on the roof. The plan is to enlarge the front entrance to include side lights, raise roof ridge, add new large front dormer centered over new front entry gable, remove the smaller pair of gables, add new covered front porch, porch shed roof supported by columns on piers, add full shed dormer on rear.

Applicant Comments: Contractor Mr. Elrod said because of settling, cracks, and proposed changes, they are requesting approval to paint the existing brick. The new second story will be cedar shingles or lapped wood. The footprint of the house is changing very little.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines*** – **Additions, Materials**, Mr. Ristaino made a MOTION to APPROVE the addition with revised plans to show: (1) new front dormer pushed back on sides, (2) roof ridge raised to accommodate 3/12 pitch on rear, (3) new rear shed to tie below ridge, (4) chimney extended if needed, (5) lower rake on rear and top rake extended, (6) 12'18" overhang, (7) correct drawn windows and make consistent, (8) lapped wood siding, (9) new shutters within policy. Mr. Duffy seconded.

VOTE: 7/2            AYES: GEORGE, DUFFY, EGAN, GLENNON, RISTAINO,  
YARBROUGH, LOW

NAYS: CORBUS, ERVIN

DECISION: ADDITION APPROVED WITH STAFF TO REVIEW PLANS REVISED AS STATED IN MOTION.

---

Application: 708 South Summit Avenue – New Construction.

A 35 unit multi-family four story building is proposed for the edge of the Wesley Heights neighborhood. Parking will be to the edge and rear. Historic District opinion is being sought before an application is ultimately filed and as plans are being developed. Comments were favorable with direction given to be very careful and vigilant about protection of the trees. It was suggested that all elevations should be given the same attention as the front. The Commission reserved offering direction on a project that needs a rezoning to happen.

---

Application: 231 West Park Avenue – Addition.

This is a one story wood sided house with a hipped roof in the Wilmore neighborhood. The proposal is to add a second story for a master bedroom on the rear. A new side facing gable will be behind the existing chimney. Materials will match existing.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on the need for further design study, Ms. George made a MOTION to offer Design Review to the applicant before coming back to the full Commission. Ms. Yarbrough seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: CORBUS, GEORGE, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GLENNON, LOW, RISTAINO, YARBROUGH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: APPLICATION DEFERRED FOR FURTHER DESIGN STUDY.

---

Mr. Powers had two issues to explain.

- 318 Settlers Lane. It is expected that a recent denial will be appealed to the ZBA and remanded back to the HDC for review.
- The entire HDC process is being revamped, creating other mechanisms for input. The focus will be on up/down votes. 2013 will see a complete change. The upcoming Retreat will offer a first look.

With business completed, the meeting adjourned at 10:45 pm with a meeting length of 7 hours and 35 minutes.

---

Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the Historic District Commission

